ECONOMY AND CULTURE IN TRANSITIONS: 
A COMPARATIVE STUDY OF TWO ARCHITECTURAL HERITAGE SITES OF BAZARS AND HANS OF BURSA AND DHAKA

Tasleem Shakur, Roxana Hafiz, Tulin Vural Arslan and Arzu Cahantımur

Abstract
Chawkbazar in Dhaka and Covered Bazaar in Bursa are two unique examples showing the contradiction among the traditional and the contemporary life-styles and their reflections on space uses and architecture. The first example in Dhaka is one of the prime icons of Mughal architecture in Bangladesh, whereas the second one in Bursa is the first example of the typical nucleus of traditional Ottoman city. Based on these two case studies in Dhaka (Bangladesh) and Bursa (Turkey), this paper attempts to illustrate how the emerging cultures and spaces are continuously being either negotiated or contested with their adjacent historic sites (Shakur, 2005). This comparative research between two similar historical sites (Mughal and Ottoman) but miles apart geographically is intended to understand the commonalities in its economic, social, cultural aspects through its transformation from the historic to the contemporary period. It highlights the socio-economic and cultural transformation and its implications for future conservation and development.

Keywords
Urban transformation, architectural and cultural heritage, traditional Bazaar, Bursa, Dhaka.

Introduction
A common understanding of Bazaar is a permanent merchandising area, marketplace, or street of shops where goods and services are exchanged or sold. For both Bangladesh and Turkey (and for many parts of the Islamic world), the word derives from the Persian word ‘Pazar’, the etymology of which goes back to the Pahlavi word baha-char (or sometimes spelled as ‘Pazar’ in English translation) meaning “the place of prices”. Historically (and according to some Architectural/historian academics), Turkish bazars generally contain a number of multifunctional buildings such as bedestens, bath houses (hammams), hans (khans) along with shops, market stalls and a mosques (Peterson, 1996:32). Although the current meaning of the word is believed to have originated in Persia, its use has spread and now has been accepted in the dialects and languages of countries around the world.

It seems that in Bangladesh, this name was derived with the arrival of the Mughals to this region (early seventeenth century). Bazaars have evolved over time and were influenced by the cultures of different regimes that came
to rule the region of Bangladesh. Starting from the open-to-sky markets to glitzy shopping malls - all are evidences of their gradual evolution catering to the needs of people with regard to time, history and locale. Bazaars, in the regions of Bangladesh, are traditional markets located in open spaces where traders gather for part of the day to sell their goods. Traders sat in rows or in a circle to sell their wares; the idea was to display as well see what others had to offer. In the later years, temporary structures were erected for protection from the sun and rains. Much afterward the structures were permanently built with brick and concrete. In Bangladesh the Bazaar or markets are places where people socialize and spend time to recreate from the drudgery of daily life, in addition to trading. The Chawk Bazaar is an evidence of the glorious past of Dhaka and a very old commercial center.

Similarly, Turkey which contains a glorious socio-cultural, architectural and political history has very old and rich examples of traditional commercial districts. Like Dhaka, Bursa (the first capital of the Ottoman Empire) has one of the earliest examples of Turkish bazaar which was first developed in the fourteenth century (Peterson, 1996: 33). However, unlike in Dhaka (Bangladesh), here in Bursa (Turkey) such early examples of bazaar includes half a dozen of mosques, baths (or hammams), khans, madrassahs and a bedesten (closed form of Turkish market, more like a warehouse where goods of high value were traded). However, these districts have faced physical, economic and social decline due to the boom in personal mobility (i.e. the car) and convenience of shopping in out-of-town shopping areas.

Thus, this study intends to provide a comparative study of the development of one of the most fascinating Bazaars - Chawk Bazar of Dhaka (Bangladesh) and the historic covered Bazars and Hans of Bursa (Turkey) which underwent varied economic, social and cultural transformations at different political times. It also attempts to illustrate how the emerging cultures and spaces are continuously either negotiated or contested through various socio-economic, political, cultural and aesthetic factors with their implications from local to international world.

**Methodology of the Study**

This article intends to investigate a comparative historical development of the old Bazaars in Dhaka (Bangladesh) and covered Bazaar and Han region in Bursa (Turkey). The concept of Bazaar are similar in both the Islamic historic spaces of old Dhaka and old Bursa. However, the historic shopping spaces of Bursa is a bit different than that of Dhaka as it is more of an elaborate complex of buildings and functions where Chawkbazar (Dhaka) is more or less a homogeneous one large layout of shopping. Although, somewhat similar to Bursa, Chawkbazar is surrounded by a few old historic residential places (which at one time was used as Sarai khana or in Turkish concept Kerwan Serai which is more of like a hotel for travelling merchants) mosques and madrassahs. In current usage they are not so much an integral part of the Bazaar. It is therefore the researchers took slightly different approaches in researching two different geographic locations. However, both the research teams adopted a heuristic approach and overview the transformation periods in the development of the Bazaar areas. Because of the high density and mixed
use development in Dhaka, this case study undertook a survey of the Chawk Bazaar to understand the changing land use pattern of the Bazaar and trace the changes that occurred over time. Here some participant observations and focussed group meetings was held with local traders, especially the seniors, in order to know about its past. This was undertaken to compensate the paucity of the existing historical record.

While the Bursa study undertook a survey of the bazaar to understand spatial, social and economic features of the district and trace the changes that occurred over time. Within the scope of this study, existing written documents, thesis, articles, old photographs, air photos, old maps and planning studies were searched by both the research teams in Bursa and Dhaka to get all possible data. Comparison of old photographs and maps with current ones showed striking changes in the form and structure of the Bazaars. In the conclusion part of the paper, the commonalities in transformation periods of these two case studies from different geographies are summarized with a table.

A Historical Account of the Development of Dhaka and Bursa

The central location of Dhaka prompted Islam Khan, the Mughal Governor (or Subedar) establish his capital here in 1610 (see Map 1a). The Mughal town of Dhaka expanded rapidly growing around the old Fort (presently the Central Jail). It also grew as an important commercial center largely through its

Map 1a (left): Dhaka and its surroundings (insets) (Source: www.banglapedia.org/httpdoc).
establishment as an inland port or Shah Bandar. Traders, local and foreign, flocked to Dhaka to do business. As Dhaka grew, artisans, craftsmen and manufacturers came to settle here. Gold, silver, brass, wood and shell work flourished, but the production of cotton goods surpassed all others. The production of the world famous Muslin prospered under the patronage of the Mughal rulers. It is stated that in the 18th century between 28 lakh of rupees to 40 lakh of rupees worth of cotton goods were exported annually from Dhaka, and most of it to Europe (Ahmed, 1986).

At its peak, Dhaka had a population of 900,000. However, Dhaka began to decline when the capital was relocated to Murshidabad by Subedar Murshid Kuli Khan in 1715-16, but it remained the headquarters of the Mughal army and navy in Eastern Bengal. The Mughal General Mir Habib, under the deputy governorship of Mirza Lutfullah (Murshid Kuli Khan II), conquered Tippera and put it under the jurisdiction of Dhaka. Dhaka’s commerce grew by leaps and bounds after this conquest.

A sharp decline in trade and commerce was again experienced when the British East India Company became the ruler of Bengal in 1765. Prior the conquest of India, it was Bengal that the British East India Company subjugated and their near monopolistic control of trade and imposition of heavy customs and duties blighted the trade of Dhaka. Also, the shifting of capital later to Calcutta (now Kolkata) drew away the bulk of commerce from Dhaka. Much of the trade had followed traditional patterns and economic life was listless as the Mughal regime collapsed. The water routes, which were meticulously maintained to keep them navigable throughout the year, fell into despair as a result of dire negligence on the part of the colonial administrators and due to the introduction of the railway and motorized vehicles. Lack of security forced merchants to pay high premiums for export of merchandise to Kolkata. The abolition of inland transit duties and town duties set in motion the recovery of Dhaka and it became the most populous town of Bengal by 1840 (Ahmed, 2009). The commerce of the city was mainly concentrated at Chawk Bazaar, the Mughal’s main emporium in Dhaka; other bazaars were located not far away from it.

The other forces that rekindled renewal were administrative, educational and commercial and Dhaka banked on these to spring back to prominence by the end of the 19th century. Then in 1947 it became capital city of the province of East Pakistan and in 1971 it was the capital city of a sovereign state. The finale of transformation of Dhaka was that of a modern metropolis. Newspapers, electronic media, motorized transport, railway, telephone and telegraph, the internet, the shopping malls - all symbolizes modernization (Ahmed, 1986). New forms of trade, commerce and manufactures laid the foundations for renewed economic life in Dhaka.

Bursa, established in Southern Marmara Region in the north-east part of Turkey in 185 B.C., was named “Prusa” after the Bithynian King Prusias I (Map1b). After Roman and Byzantian periods, it was conquered by Sultan Orhan in 1326 and was declared as the first capital of the Ottomans. Bursa continued to serve as the civic center, while Edirne was named the military center in 1365, until Istanbul became the capital of the
Ottoman Empire in 1453 (Dostoglu and Vural, 2002). Various researchers have documented that Bursa became one of the most important commercial and production centers in the world between 1450 and 1600, even though Istanbul was declared as the capital of the Ottomans in 1453 (Yenen, 1992: 303; Dostoglu and Vural, 2002). In this period, Bursa, which was located on the westernmost extension of the Silk Road and Spice Routes, the transfer of both silk from Tabriz to Italy, and spices from India to north European countries was realized through the city. Also it has been the center of sericulture and silk production since the 15th Century. The city, being an important silk production place, had been a fundamental commercial center in marketing silk produced both in domestic market and in Europe. “Han”s and Covered Bazaar Region being situated at the city center had functioned both as a commercial center and also as an important place of socialization for the Ottoman way of life that had a culture of “closed society” (Dostoglu and Vural, 2001).

The city was reduced in size in the 17th and 18th centuries due to the Celali revolts and the decrease in the demand for silk based on the economic crisis in the Mediterranean world. The influence of the Industrial Revolution gradually being observed in the Ottoman Empire, new developments took place in Bursa after mid 19th century. This transformation was inevitable because textile production, which had continued in the form and scale of home production until the 19th century in Bursa, could not compete with textile production in Europe in terms of cost or quality due to technological backwardness. In this process, many silk factories, new state, municipality and bank buildings were constructed in Bursa, and the railway from Bursa to the one of its provinces harbor, Mudanya harbor, was implemented in the second half of the 19th century. In short, the 19th century can be described as a period during which the Ottomans were institutionally directed towards the West (Dostoglu, 1999: 87-91; Dostoglu and Vural, 2001: 241).

The position of Bursa as a commercial center still continues today due to the industrialization process it underwent during the early Republican Period in the 20th century. However, transformations occurring both in the economical and social structures as a corollary of the industrialization and globalization have influenced everyday life of the city as well as the sense of space where everyday life takes place. Industrial and commercial activities in Bursa, which have been diffused in each other throughout the centuries, have become separated and moved to different parts of the city with the establishment of Organized Industrial District in 1961 and its forthcoming industrialization process. During this process of change, historical commercial district in the city center that has been such a place for production, consumption and social interaction, for centuries has begun to lose its importance. However, with the raising awareness about the sustainability and cultural economy in the late 20th century, historical commercial district in Bursa have begun to regain its popularity. Local governments, inhabitants and merchants have reinvented the authenticity and economical value of Bursa. In parallel to this awareness Bursa Metropolitan Municipality was applied for as a UNESCO World Heritage City in 2000. Now Bursa and Cumalikizik Early Ottoman urban and rural settlements is placed in the tentative list of UNESCO (http://alanbaskanligi.bursa.bel.tr/
The Chawk Bazar

The Chawk Bazar is one of the most historic and oldest business centre located near the Central Jail and the River Buriganga in Old Dhaka (see Map 2). During the Mughal rules wherever the Subedar put up their tents, invariably a bazar used to develop nearby to cater to the needs of dignitaries and the soldiers.

It is stated that Raja Man Singh, on behalf of the then Mughal Emperor, came to East Bengal (presently the region of Bangladesh) to crush a rebellion brewing up in this region. Raja Man Singh in this endeavor shifted his administrative centre to the present Central Jail site in 1602 and established a fort there; and, the Chawk Bazar developed close by as a result. A stone inscription, however, states that it was the Governor or Subedar Murshid Kuli Khan who established this Bazar in 1702 and named it the ‘Padshahi Bazar’ or the ‘Badshahi Bazar.’ Murshid Kuli Khan developed the Chawk as self-contained place with caravanserais, mosque, etc. The Chawk Bazar Shahi Mosque was built so that traders and locals could say their prayers on time. It was his son-in-law, Naib Nazim Luthfullah alias Murshid Kuli Khan II, who later rebuilt this Bazar (Mohsin, 2009: 79; Mamun, 1993: 75).

The Chawk Bazar was considered a very posh business center during the Mughal and the British Colonial regimes. The close location of the Boro Katra and the Chhoto Katra, the two magnificent residences of Mughal dignitaries, signifies the importance of this Bazar. A historical account reveal that the old name of this Bazar was ‘Nakhas’ meaning slave-trader and it is assumed that the Chawk Bazar was also a place for slave-trading (Mamun, 1993). The Chawk Bazar was a nucleus around which Persians, Greeks, Armenians, Portuguese, Kashmiris, etc. conducted their trades. The Chawk Bazar was considered one of the most important business centres in the South-East Asian region.

The Chawk Bazar earned its fame as a place for social, religious and political gathering and tete-a-tete. During the month of Muharram wrestlers, lathials and sword-players gathered in the Chawk to show off their feats. Also marsias were sung, the Holy Qur’an recited and religious discussion held during this month (Taifoor, 1956). The Chawk was, and is still famous, for the Mughlai foods available throughout the year and the varieties of Iftari it offers to the city-dwellers during the holy month of Ramadan.

Transformation of the Chawk Bazar

Early Dhaka, on the bank of River Buriganga, was easily discernible by the pre-Mughal city with its moat-like protection and the Mughal city extending beyond the protection of the moat (see Map 2). This map shows the rectangular Chawk Bazaar (also spelled as Chouk Bazar and very rarely as Chalk Bazaar), the Fort and the Katras are on the left and two pre-Mughal period forts are on the right corner. The physical design of Chawk Bazaar initially shows a rectangular shaped open space with brick paved carriage-ways built all around, which presently forms part of the existing road network. The market used to be held under the sky in the late afternoon or after sundown. Traders thronged to this place with various merchandise which similarly
attracted buyers from all places.

The Chawk Bazar Shahi Mosque, built in 1706, had permanent shops on the ground floor level. The Mosque is still in use, but repeated renovations had transformed it beyond recognition. The Boro Katra had 22 shops on the ground level beside the residential spaces on the top floor. It had other on-site facilities, such as dining, storage space, medical care, and stalls for horses—all for free. The Chhoto Katra, though smaller in size, was built in a similar manner like the Boro Katra and had similar facilities. Both the Katras are in dilapidated conditions at present. The Chawk Bazar has also undergone vast changes during the latter part of its 400 years of existence.

Transformation began with the erection of temporary shops within and by containing the space of the Bazaar (see figures 1 and 2) with walls (460 feet long, 4 feet high and half a foot wide) all around having 16 entry gates. The changes were done by the then Magistrate Walter between 1823 and 1825. The Magistrate also placed the Bibi Mariam Canon inside the Bazaar. The road running all around the perimeter of the Bazaar was metalled and the road connecting Islampur and the Bazaar was widened and metalled.

The transformation became more apparent with rebuilding of shops in a more permanent manner. After the emergence of Bangladesh, a drastic change was evident in the skyline as temporary structures were gradually replaced by multi-storied, permanent structures. The ground floors of the buildings are being used as commercial, light industries or shops and the upper floors are used either as shops or

Map 2: Dhaka on the bank of River Buriganga, showing the rectangular Chawk Bazaar with roads all around, the Fort and the Katras on the left and two pre-Mughal period forts on the right corner (Source: http://dhakatown.net/dhaka-city-map (left) and the other (on the right) was drawn from Field Survey).
godowns or both; very little residential use emerged inside Chawk Bazaar. These buildings were constructed without maintaining setback or regrads for designs of architectural significance. Buildings were built back to back and side to side making it one very jumbled and unaesthetic development (see Map 3 and Figure 3). Neither the local people nor the successive city administrators took regard of this matter.

Figure 1: The Chawk Bazaar in 1885 with Bibi Marium Canon at one side. Also note temporary structures built inside the Bazaar (Source: http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/File:Bibi_Mariam_Cannon.jpg).

Figure 2: The Chawk Bazaar in 1904. Note the open space of the Bazaar filled with structures (Source: http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/File:Dacca_Town_Chawk.jpg).

Figure 3: Present chaotic Chawk Bazaar (Source: Authors - Field Survey, 2010).
The Covered Bazaar and Han Region of Bursa

Bursa when conquered by Turks in 1326 was a comparatively small Byzantine settlement. For the establishment of Bursa as an Ottoman city, empty area out of the castle, extending from east to west had been chosen as the place of nucleus. Its proximity to the city walls had provided the security of the bazaar and in addition to that, as a result of the expansion of city on the east-west direction, this place had become a central location for the city of Bursa (Cezar, 1985). The location of the social, economical and cultural center of the city have not been changed throughout the centuries and Covered Bazaar and Han Region, as the major place for trade and social activity, has kept its place in this center.

Map 3: Present Chawk Bazaar showing intense development pattern (Source: Authors - Field Survey, 2010)

Transformation periods of Bursa’s Covered Bazaar and Han Region

Commercial districts in Ottoman cities have generally preserved their spatial characteristics and location through the centuries. Although, they had kept their original form for centuries, they had effected by the social, political and economical changes both in Ottoman Empire and in the world in 19th and 20th centuries. Besides the spatial structure, social and economical structures of these districts have had also some reformations as the results of these changes. This spatial transformation of historical commercial districts in Anatolian Turkish cities can be analyzed within five periods:

1. Establishment: until the 16th century (Cezar, 1985)
2. Stagnation: during the 17th and 18th centuries (Cezar, 1985)
3. Transformation under the forces of early industrialization: the period of spatial and functional transformation from the mid of the 19th century to mid of 20th century (Cezar, 1985).
4. Transformation under the forces of globalization: The period of spatial and functional transformation from the mid of 20th century to 21st century (Vural, 2009)
5. Reinvention of the authenticity: The period of spatial and functional revitalization in 21st century
Establishment period until 16th century
The initial buildings forming the Covered Bazaar and Han District had been built in Orhan Gazi Period (the second Sultan of Ottoman Empire) in 14th century: Emir Han, Orhan Mosque and Orhan Bath. After then, Kapan Han and Bedesten had been built around Emir Han. The presence of Bedesten in Bursa Bazaar had aroused both native and foreign merchants’ interest to the city. This had caused the development of long distance trade in Bursa, which had been placed on the important trade roads and led to increase its commercial importance. After Emir Han and Bedesten being constructed, in the following two centuries each of the prevailing Ottoman Sultans had constructed many Han buildings. As the number of the Han buildings increased, new shopping streets appeared on the axes connecting the Hans and Bedesten such as Long Bazaar and Covered Bazaar.

Map 4: The center of the Covered Bazaar and Han District (Bursa Metropolitan Municipality Archive) (Black ones shows non-existent buildings in present time).
By the time 16th century, Bursa Bazaar had nearly succeeded (see map 4 for the original form of commercial district in Bursa)

**Stagnation period between 17th and 18th centuries**

Formation of the historical commercial district in Bursa had lasted until the 16th century in such a way as justifying Cezar’s thesis. During that time period, some of the important trade routes like Silk Road or Spice Trade Routes had lost their importance as a result of the discovery of new sea routes. Due to this fact, between the 17th and 18th centuries, such a significant commercial buildings had not been built, after Cocoon Han and Fidan Han. Many of the Ottoman cities, like Bursa, had not lived significant changes in their historical commercial districts until the 19th century (Cezar, 1985) (see table 1).

**Transformation under the forces of early industrialization: The period of spatial and functional transformation from the mid 19th to mid of 20th centuries.**

During the Industrialization of the city in 19th century, the organic structure of the city had been deformed by the opening of new traffic routes. Although these routes were opened in order to provide better transportation for the products of newly appeared factories in the north and west sides of the city, they were also the symbol of the Westernization attempts of Ottoman Empire (Dostoglu and Vural, 2002). There had not been a holistic planning strategy. Local governors who have the authorization of administration on behalf of the government had limited visions. So, short term planning strategies including partial and intuitive approaches were observed. In that period, Covered Bazaar and Han District had been limited with the opening of Cumhuriyet Street on the north, Inonu Street on the east and Atatürk Street on the south (Vural, 2009) (see table 1).
Transformation under the forces of globalization: The period of spatial and functional transformation from the mid of 20th century to 21st century

Radical transformation of Hans and Covered Bazaar Region in Bursa began with the 1958 Bursa fire. 1958 Bursa fire starting in a printing workshop in August 1958 had widely spread through the bazaar area and had almost demolished the historical commercial center for the destructive effects of 1958 fire on commercial district. In order to rehabilitation and partly reconstruction of the district a foreign planner, Prof. Luigi Piccinato was assigned. Professor Luigi Piccinato’s project was initiated in 1958 year of which objective was to regain the original structure of the area (Piccinato, 1961).

The dynamism of everyday life in historical commercial district had been interrupted between 1958 and 1965 due to the restoration works. However, 1960s were a significant period for social and economical life in Bursa. Because in the master plan prepared by Piccinato in 1960, the presence of Bursa Organised Industrial District has led to the significant transformations in economical and social life in the city (Dostoglu and Vural, 2002). Bursa had increased its importance as an industrial and commercial city by the end of 1960s. In 1960s, as the importance of Bursa increased as an industrial city, service requirements like banks, insurance companies, offices have become an important necessity. As a result of this, multi-storey blocks, in the middle of 1960s had been constructed with an aim of providing these services on the west part of the commercial district. Another reflection of economical and social transformations in Bursa after 60s has been seen in the north part of historical commercial district. In that area, business centers including shops and offices for wholesale and retail of textile products started to open towards the end of 1970s (see figure 5 and table 1).

Transformations in the concept of shopping and economical changes in Turkey during the 1990s under the influence of consumerism affect the architectural identity of the historical commercial district. Spatial concept of the shops has changed through socio-economical developments. Shops with blinding shop windows, attractive lights, and remarkable shop-signs have become the new architectural characteristics of the historical commercial district. Changes in historical commercial district can not only be limited changing appearance of the shops, but also the products that are sold also changed.

Reinvention Authenticity

The period of spatial and functional revitalization in 21st century Revitalization works in Bursa Covered Bazaar and “Han”s District in 20th century has begun after its partly burn-off in 1958 Bursa Fire With Prof. Luigi Piccinato’s Project which can be considered as the first project having a wholistic approach about the revitalization of the district.

Another wholistic project about revitalization of historical commercial district in Bursa, called “Bursa Reyhan, Kayhan and “Han” s District Preservation and Development Project”, was prepared by the academicians affiliated with METU, in 1988. The aim of this project is defined, as follows: rehabilitation of these districts while protecting their unique values; clearing the physical additions which were not belong to the
original structure of the buildings; design of new buildings in consideration to the architectural and historical value of the district (Kirayoglu, 2004).

However, in the implementation phase of this project by local municipalities after 2000s, main aims of the METU’s project, considering the unique values of the district, have been partly neglected. In restoration of the some of the “Han” buildings, the usage of contemporary building materials and radical changes in their functions give them an appearance of a theatre stage rather than buildings having witnessed 700 year history of Bursa. Also, in revitalization part of the project, facade renovations do not reflect the original characteristics of the district, rather than they reflect the characteristic of the streets in mid-European countries with their ornamented white jambs and colorful facades. Also, different attitudes about the architectural appearance of shelter projects which are applied in different parts of the district give a chaotic appearance to the whole area. (Vural Arslan, et.al, 2011) (see figure 6 and figure 7 to compare the transformation please see also figure 4a and figure 4b, table 1).

Findings and Conclusions
Throughout the study authors intended to find parallels between the development of bazaar areas in two different cultures. The findings of this evaluations are shown in Table 1. In both of the case studies it was found that especially after 1947, unique historical, cultural and economical
Economy and Culture in Transitions: A Comparative Study of Two Architectural Heritage Sites of Bazars and Hans of Bursa and Dhaka

TASLEEM SHAKUR, ROXANA HAFIZ, TÜLIN VURAL ARSLAN AND ARZU CAHANTIMUR

Figure 6: A view of Long Bazaar in 2009 (Source: Photo by Vural Arslan).

Figure 7: A view of Pirinc Han in 2009 (Source: photo by Vural Arslan).

Map 5: Land use in the Bursa Covered Bazaar and Han District (Source: Authors - Field survey in 2012).
value of the Bazaars and Hans have been reinvented by local governments, merchants and also inhabitants of the city. In Bursa case, it is seen that although revitalization works in the district in order to regain the authentic character of the district are being done with good faith and effort, the lack of systematised organisation in these works (which includes the support of specialists and academics) turns some part of the district a theatre stage. Also, different architectural attitudes about the additions which are implemented in different parts of the district give a chaotic appearance to the whole area.

In Chawk Bazaar example, it was understood that there had not been any systematized revitalization works, too. However, it is known that transformation from industrial to post-industrial city and rapid globalization have led to the revaluation and commodification of place at a local level. In this process, urban places are re-imagined and invested with new cultural meanings to encourage greater visual and physical consumption. Revitalization works have been the main part of this process. Chawk Bazar still bears the distinctiveness of a traditional bazaar of the Mughal era which are now on the verge of extinct elsewhere. As medieval Mughal business center, Chawk Bazar possesses strong historical background. Till now it is the biggest wholesale market and has a high contribution to the urban and national economy. It also provides employment and business opportunities for a huge number of people. Therefore, Chawk Bazar has a great impact on the national life of Bangladesh because it is both a historical site and a business center. Proper management should be undertaken to preserve both Chawk Bazar and Covered Bazaar and Han District in Bursa as a historical site and to enhance its business so that it has a larger contribution to the economy of the country.

In the article, it is seen that retail activity and retail spaces have changed at a variable speed in terms of establishment, stagnation; transformation and re-invention across two different parts of the world over the past fifty years (see table 1). Among the causes for these changes, although comparable, are profound transformations in the economic, social and physical structures of cities under the influence of modernisation (Europeanization) and globalisation (mainly westernisation).

One important finding which emerged from this comparative study is the influence of long period of British colonisation and the continuation of the policies during the post-colonial period (in Bengal, now Bangladesh) and relatively shorter period of westernisation (in Turkey during the Republican period) . Figure 2 of Chawkbazar (Dhaka in 1904) and Figures 4a and 4b (Bursa in 1913 and 1910) should suggest marked influence of European influence in Dhaka and much lesser impact of westernisation in Bursa. This is subject which should provide us with good understanding with other Islamic cultured of different parts of the world during the same period. It will be also interesting to note how far in the history each cultures are going back to preserve their architectural and cultural heritage?

Due to the pressure on city centres (including the impact of privatisation); traditional commercial districts were abandoned because they could not compensate for the requirements of changing expectations of the
Table 1: Comparison of the transformation periods in Bursa and Dhaka cases.
commercial areas (such as parking lots, transportation, and entertainment facilities). Both in Dhaka and Bursa cases, the lack of holistic approaches to revitalisation projects (from the city authority and the formal sector) the traditional commercial districts have brought forth only preservation of some physical space and provision of the required financial resources. In order to attain sustainable development of these areas, the old myth still applies, that is holistic approaches to revitalisation of these districts that consider social, economic and cultural revitalisation with physical revitalisation together be developed.

References


Dostoglu, N. & Vural, T. (2002). The Role of Western Planners in the Transformation of Bursa from a Traditional Ottoman City to a Metropolitan Center of the Turkish Republic. In: Turgut, H & Kellett P (Eds.), Traditional Environments in A New Millennium (pp. 239-246) Istanbul: Second International Symposium of IAPS-CSBE Network Book Series.


Economy and Culture in Transitions:
A Comparative Study of Two Architectural Heritage Sites of Bazars and Hans of Bursa and Dhaka

**Tasleem Shakur** is a Senior Lecturer NGAS, Edge Hill University, Lancashire, United Kingdom shakurt@edgehill.ac.uk

**Roxana Hafiz** is a Professor, Department of Planning, Bangladesh University of Engineering & Technology, Dhaka, Bangladesh, roxanahafiz@gmail.com

**Tulin Vural Arslan** is an Associate Professor at Department of Architecture Uludag University, Bursa, Turkey, tulinv@yahoo.com

**Arzu Cahantimur** is an Associate Professor at Department of Architecture Uludag University, Bursa, Turkey, arzucahan@gmail.com